

Arizona Department of Environmental Quality CPP Outreach Plan and Report

01 Feb 2016

Introduction

As required by 40 CFR 60.5765(a)(3), this report provides a demonstration of:

- Opportunity for public comment on the initial submittal;
- Meaningful engagement with stakeholders, including vulnerable communities, during the initial submittal preparation period; and
- Plans for engagement during development of the final plan.

This report is generated from an Access database that ADEQ uses to plan and track CPP outreach activities. The report identifies:

- The types of outreach in which ADEQ has engaged or plans to engage during the initial submittal preparation period (Table 1);
- Communities, including vulnerable communities, that ADEQ will attempt to engage in the public discussion of Arizona's § 111(d) plan (Table 2)
- The types of impacts that may be expected from implementation of the Clean Power Plan (CPP), according to the Notice of Final Rulemaking (Table 3);
- Arizona organizations that represent the interests of or have existing relationships with vulnerable communities and that may assist or partner with ADEQ in its outreach efforts (Table 4);
- Planned or completed outreach events (Table 5).

During the development of the initial submittal, monthly drafts of this report will be generated and made available on ADEQ's CPP Stakeholder Process Website:

<http://www.azdeg.gov/enviro/air/stakeholder.html>

Table 1: Outreach Types

<u>Outreach Type</u>	<u>Description</u>
Advisory Committee	Meeting of the Vulnerable Communities Outreach Advisory Committee
Conference Call	ADEQ conference call with a specific community or its representatives
Local Meeting	ADEQ meeting with specific communities at a location convenient for the community members
Mass Mailing	Mass mailing or distribution to community members with a questionnaire that can be mailed in or completed online
Newsletter	An organization provides notice of ADEQ CPP activity in its newsletter using information supplied by ADEQ
Organization Meeting	Meeting with one or more organizations representing interests of vulnerable communities
Other Meeting	Meetings with other interested parties regarding CPP
Participation	ADEQ participation in an outreach event sponsored by an organization
Stakeholder	Stakeholder meetings held monthly at ADEQ's offices in Phoenix; open to public including members and representatives of vulnerable communities; conference call access is available
Surrogate	An organization conducts outreach using ADEQ materials and reports results back to Department
TBD	To be determined

Table 2: Communities

<u>Name</u>	<u>Description</u>
Indian Tribes	Tribal lands located within the boundaries of the State of Arizona
Rural	Residents of rural areas served by electric cooperatives
Employees	Employees of coal-fired power plants
NGCC	Residents of areas in the vicinity of NGCC EGUs
Low Income	Low income residents of Arizona
POC	People of color living anywhere in Arizona
Public	All members of the public, including vulnerable communities

Table 3: Impacts

<u>Name</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Type</u>
Climate Change Mitigation	Mitigation of future climate change resulting from the implementation of the CPP as part of the United States' contribution to the Paris Agreement	Benefit
Conventional Pollutant Mitigation	Reduction in emissions of conventional pollutants (e.g. NO _x , SO ₂) resulting from implementation of the CPP	Benefit
Employment Opportunities	Potential new jobs that may result from the CPP's encouragement of clean energy technologies	Benefit
NGCC Increases	Increases in NGCC generation, and resulting increases in local emissions of conventional pollutants, resulting from the CPP's incentive to shift from fossil-fuel steam to NGCC	Detriment
Employment Losses	Potential losses in employment resulting from the CPP's incentives to retire or curtail high-carbon generation	Detriment
Rate Increases	Potenital increases in electricity rates resulting from the costs of compliance with the CPP	Detriment

Table 4: Organizations

Arizona Community Action Association (ACAA)

Type: NGO

Communities: Low Income

Region(s): Arizona

Description:

Website: <http://azcaa.org/>

Representative(s):

Kevin Hengehold, Energy Program Director

Email:

khengehold@azcaa.org

Arizona Corporation Commission (ACC)

Type: Government

Communities: Indian Tribes, Low Income

Region(s): Arizona

Description:

Website:

Representative(s):

Maureen Scott

Email:

mScott@azcc.gov

Arizona State University (ASU)

Type: Education

Communities: Low Income, POC

Region(s): Maricopa County

Description: ASU has expressed an interest in facilitating outreach to vulnerable communities in the Phoenix area.

Website:

Representative(s):

Maren Mahoney, Strategic Initiatives Coordinator,
Energy Policy and Innovation Council

Jennifer Richter, Assistant Professor, Justice and
Sociotechnical Change

Email:

maren.mahoney@asu.edu

jennifer.richter@asu.edu

Association for the Tree of Life (ATL)

Type: NGO

Communities: Public

Region(s): Arizona

Description: From the ATL Website: "ATL is a lead organization in calling for and catalyzing the broad-based media, educational, and grassroots campaigns leading to national carbon fee policy."

Website: <http://www.tree-of-life.works/>

Representative(s):

Vincent Pawloski, Board President

Email:

vincent@tree-of-life.works

City of Phoenix - Neighborhood Engagement Division (COP-NE)

Type: Government
Communities: Public
Region(s): Maricopa County
Description: The COP-NE has knowledge of community and neighborhood outreach opportunities and resources for the City of Phoenix and Western Maricopa County.

Website:

Representative(s): Olga Soto, Neighborhood Specialist
Email: olga.soto@phoenix.gov

Diné Citizens Against Ruining Our Environment (Dine CARE)

Type: NGO
Communities: Indian Tribes
Region(s): Navajo Nation
Description: Diné CARE is an all-Navajo environmental organization, based within the Navajo homeland. Its main goal is to empower local and traditional people to organize, speak out and determine their own destinies.

Website: <http://www.dine-care.org/>

Representative(s): Colleen Cooley, Staff
Email: ccooley22@gmail.com

Donna House, Consultant (DHC)

Type: NGO
Communities: Indian Tribes
Region(s): Navajo Nation, Northeastern Tribal Lands, Northeastern Arizona
Description: Donna works with a number of tribal community NGOs, including Black Mesa Water, and is a resource for outreach to the Navajo, Hopi and Zuni tribes.

Website:

Representative(s): Donna House
Email: nmnn2009@gmail.com

Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)

Type: Government
Communities: Indian Tribes
Region(s): Arizona
Description: The federal government government has a trust responsibility to American Indians.
Website: <http://www3.epa.gov/>

Representative(s): Anita Lee, Environmental Scientist
Email: lee.anita@epa.gov

Forgotten People Community Development Corporation (FPCD)

Type: NGO
Communities: Indian Tribes
Region(s): Arizona
Description:
Website: <http://www.forgottennavajopeople.com/>

Representative(s): JoAnn Armenta
Don Yellowman
Email: joann@forgottennavajopeople.com
Don@forgottennavajopeople.com

Grand Canyon State Electric Cooperative Association (GCSECA)

Type: Business
Communities: Rural
Region(s): Arizona
Description:
Website: <http://www.gcseca.coop/>

Representative(s): Philip Bashaw, Director of Government Relations and
Grassroots Advocacy
Email: pbashaw@gcseca.coop

Inter Tribal Council of Arizona (ITCA)

Type: Government

Communities: Indian Tribes

Region(s): Arizona

Description:

Website: <http://itcaonline.com/>

Representative(s):

Shaina White, Tribal Air Environmental Specialist

Travis Lane, Assistant Director

Bruce Robinson, Water and Energy Technical Assistance
Coordinator

Email:

shaina.white@itcaonline.com

travis.lane@itcaonline.com

Bruce.Robinson@itcaonline.com

Sierra Club - Grand Canyon Chapter (SCGCC)

Type: NGO

Communities: Public

Region(s): Arizona

Description: Mission includes "educat[ing] and enlist[ing] humanity to protect and restore the quality of the natural and human environment." Promoting energy efficiency and renewable energy is a priority.

Website: <http://www.sierraclub.org/arizona>

Representative(s):

Sandy Bahr

Email:

sandy.bahr@sierraclub.org

Table 5: Outreach Events

Completed

Meeting 9

Type:	Stakeholder	Participating Organizations:	GCSECA, ACAA, ADEQ
Communities:	Public	Location:	ADEQ Office, Phoenix, AZ
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation	StartDate:	09/01/2015 9:30 AM
Region:	Arizona		

Notes:

The meeting covered accomplishments of the previous two phases of stakeholder meetings, regulatory developments and a presentation on the final CPP rule published in August.

Meeting 10

Type:	Stakeholder	Participating Organizations:	GCSECA, ACAA, ADEQ
Communities:	Public	Location:	ADEQ Office, Phoenix, AZ
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation	StartDate:	10/06/2015 9:30 AM
Region:	Arizona		

Notes:

The meeting covered regulatory developments, the structure of ADEQ's stakeholder process, and a presentation on the proposed federal plan.

Meeting 11

Type:	Stakeholder	Participating Organizations:	GCSECA, ACAA, ADEQ
Communities:	Public	Location:	ADEQ Office, Phoenix, AZ
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation	StartDate:	11/03/2015 9:30 AM
Region:	Arizona		

Notes:

The meeting included a discussion of comments on the proposed federal plan, a presentation on the CPP requirements for outreach to vulnerable communities, and a summary of ADEQ's work plan for completing an initial submittal by 9/6/2016.

EPA's CPP Training for Tribal Communities

Type:	Participation	Participating Organizations:	EPA, FPCD, Dine CARE, ADEQ
Communities:	Indian Tribes, Low Income	Location:	Moenkopi Legacy Inn & Suites, Tuba City, AZ
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation, Conventional Pollutant Mitigation, Employment Opportunities	StartDate:	12/10/2015 8:00 AM
Region:	Northeastern Tribal Lands		

Notes:

ADEQ staff participated in the "Governmental Resources Panel" and provided a 20-minute presentation on Arizona's process for developing a 111(d) plan and how the plan could affect tribal communities. Staff also spoke with a number of tribal community representatives regarding their concerns and questions about the state's plan.

ADEQ staff also attended EPA's training for tribal community organizers on 12/9/2015.

Meeting 12

Type:	Stakeholder	Participating Organizations:	ADEQ
Communities:	Public	Location:	ADEQ Office, Phoenix, AZ
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation	StartDate:	01/05/2016 9:30 AM
Region:	Arizona		

Notes:

Meeting covered: update on process and technical workgroup; presentation by environmental coalition including Sierra Club, APHA, ACAA, GCT, WRA on comments on federal plan, suggestions for state implementation; ADEQ presentation on ranking of compliance options.

Discussion with ITCA Staff

Type:	Conference Call	Participating Organizations:	ITCA
Communities:	Indian Tribes	Location:	Conference Call from ADEQ Phoenix office
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation, Conventional Pollutant Mitigation, NGCC Increases	StartDate:	01/06/2016 3:00 PM
Region:	Arizona		

Notes:

Discussed ITCA assistance with increasing tribal representation in public stakeholder process, adding a tribal representative to the TWG and facilitating direct outreach to tribal communities.

Follow-Up to EPA Tribal Training

Type:	Participation	Participating Organizations:	EPA, FPCD, DHC
Communities:	Indian Tribes	Location:	Conference call from ADEQ office in Phoenix
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation, Conventional Pollutant Mitigation	StartDate:	01/08/2016 1:00 PM
Region:	Northeastern Tribal Lands		

Notes:

Answered questions about status of public stakeholder process, participation by tribal citizens and POC in stakeholder meetings and plans for outreach to vulnerable communities.

Reiterated willingness to have meetings with Navajo and Hopi tribes to discuss state plan specifically.

Presentation to ACAA Board of Directors

Type:	Local Meeting	Participating Organizations:	ACAA, ADEQ
Communities:	Low Income	Location:	Pinal Gila Council for Senior Citizens Conference Room, 8969 W. McCartney Road, Casa Grande, AZ 85194
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation, Conventional Pollutant Mitigation, NGCC Increases, Rate Increases	StartDate:	01/15/2016 9:00 AM
Region:	Arizona		

Notes:

Gave presentation on basics of CPP and ADEQ's outreach efforts. Received input from board on effective outreach to vulnerable communities.

Meeting with Sierra Club, ACAA

Type:	Organization Meeting	Participating Organizations:	ACAA, SCGCC
Communities:	Low Income, POC	Location:	ADEQ Office, Phoenix, AZ
Impacts to be Addressed:		StartDate:	01/19/2016 3:00 PM
Region:	Arizona		

Notes:

Meeting with representatives of coalition of environmental and community organizations to discuss 1/5/2016 letter re comments on federal plan and recommendations for AZ plan development. Also discussed outreach to vulnerable communities.

Scheduled

Meeting 13

Type:	Stakeholder	Participating Organizations:	ADEQ
Communities:	Public	Location:	ADEQ Office, Phoenix, AZ
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation	StartDate:	02/10/2016 9:30 AM
Region:	Arizona		

Notes:

Meeting 14

Type:	Stakeholder	Participating Organizations:	ADEQ
Communities:	Public	Location:	ADEQ Office, Phoenix, AZ
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation	StartDate:	03/01/2016 9:30 AM
Region:	Arizona		

Notes:

Meeting 15

Type:	Stakeholder	Participating Organizations:	ADEQ
Communities:	Public	Location:	ADEQ Office, Phoenix, AZ
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation	StartDate:	04/05/2016 9:30 AM
Region:	Arizona		
Notes:			

Meeting 16

Type:	Stakeholder	Participating Organizations:	ADEQ
Communities:	Public	Location:	ADEQ Office, Phoenix, AZ
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation	StartDate:	05/10/2016 9:30 AM
Region:	Arizona		
Notes:			

Meeting 17

Type:	Stakeholder	Participating Organizations:	ADEQ
Communities:	Public	Location:	ADEQ Office, Phoenix, AZ
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation	StartDate:	06/14/2016 9:30 AM
Region:	Arizona		
Notes:			

Meeting 18

Type:	Stakeholder	Participating Organizations:	ADEQ
Communities:	Public	Location:	ADEQ Office, Phoenix, AZ
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation	StartDate:	07/12/2016 9:30 AM
Region:	Arizona		
Notes:			

Meeting 19

Type:	Stakeholder	Participating Organizations:	ADEQ
Communities:	Public	Location:	ADEQ Office, Phoenix, AZ
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation	StartDate:	08/02/2016 9:30 AM
Region:	Arizona		
Notes:			

Unscheduled

Outreach to Communities Near Coal-Fired Plants

Type:	TBD	Participating Organizations:	DHC
Communities:	Indian Tribes, Employees	Location:	TBD
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation, Conventional Pollutant Mitigation, Employment Losses	StartDate:	
Region:	Northeastern Arizona		
Notes:			

The Zuni and Fort Apache reservations are located in this area.

Benson Meeting

Type:	Local Meeting	Participating Organizations:	GCSECA, ADEQ, AZLEG
Communities:	Rural, Employees, Low Income	Location:	
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation, Conventional Pollutant Mitigation, Employment Losses	StartDate:	
Region:	Southeastern Arizona		

Notes:

The joint legislative review committee on state plans relating to carbon dioxide emissions from existing power plants intends to conduct a meeting in Benson.

Outreach to Maricopa County Communities Near NGCC

Type:	TBD	Participating Organizations:	ADEQ
Communities:	NGCC, Low Income, POC	Location:	TBD
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation, Conventional Pollutant Mitigation, NGCC Increases	StartDate:	
Region:	Maricopa County		

Notes:

According to EPA's EJ Screening Report for the CPP, NGCC plants in Western Maricopa County are generally located near communities with relatively high minority and low-income populations. Since the CPP may result in shifts in generation to these plants, some form of outreach specifically targeting these areas would be

Meeting with the Navajo and Hopi Tribal Communities

Type:	Local Meeting	Participating Organizations:	FPCD, Dine CARE, ADEQ, DHC
Communities:	Indian Tribes, Low Income	Location:	Tuba City (tentative)
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation, Conventional Pollutant Mitigation, Employment Opportunities	StartDate:	
Region:	Northeastern Tribal Lands		

Notes:

The purpose of this meeting will be to provide tribal communities with more detailed information on ADEQ's process for developing a 111(d) plan than could be provided at the December 10, 2015 EPA training and to receive input from tribal community members.

Donna House suggested adding a meeting in Window Rock.

State-Wide Outreach

Type:	Mass Mailing	Participating Organizations:	ADEQ
Communities:	Indian Tribes, Low Income, POC	Location:	N/A
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation, Conventional Pollutant Mitigation, Employment Opportunities, Rate Increases	StartDate:	
Region:	Arizona		

Notes:

ADEQ is developing a brochure that includes basic information on the CPP and ADEQ's stakeholder process plus a questionnaire that can be filled out either online or manually and sent back postage pre paid.

Southern Tribe Outreach

Type:	Local Meeting	Participating Organizations:	EPA, ITCA, ADEQ
Communities:	Indian Tribes	Location:	TBD
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation, Conventional Pollutant Mitigation, Employment Opportunities, NGCC Increases	StartDate:	
Region:	Maricopa County		

Notes:

GRIC, Salt River, Fort McDowell, Gila Bend and northern Tohono O'odham are located near the Maricopa County cluster of NGCC, which may increase generation as a result of the CPP.

This event could be co-sponsored by EPA or could take the form of participation in another event.

On 1/11/2016, ADEQ requested an opportunity to speak at the next meeting of the ITCA member tribes to request assistance in outreach to tribal communities. The ITCA may be willing to host an event.