



A subsidiary of Pinnacle West Capital Corporation

Scott Davis
Director
Department: Environmental
Policy and Programs

Tel. 602-250-3225
Fax 602-250-3872
e-mail: Scott.Davis@aps.com

Mail Station 8376
PO Box 53999
Phoenix, Arizona 85072-3999

Via Email: jce@azdeq.gov

Certified Mail: 7006 3450 0003 7331 6277

Return Receipt Requested

August 19, 2010

Jennifer C. Thies
Remedial Projects Unit
Arizona Department of Environmental Quality
WQARF Unit Manager - 4415B-1
1110 West Washington Street
Phoenix, AZ 85007

Subject: West Van Buren Water Quality Assurance Revolving Fund (WQARF) Site
Roosevelt Irrigation District Public Health Exposure Assessment and
Mitigation Work Plan

Dear Ms. Thies:

Arizona Public Service appreciates the opportunity to provide comments on the Roosevelt Irrigation District (RID) Public Health Exposure Assessment and Mitigation Work Plan (Work Plan) prepared by Synergy Environmental, LLC, dated July 26, 2010. The Work Plan was submitted to the Arizona Department of Environmental Quality (ADEQ) in response to the requirements imposed by the Agency in the conditional approval of RID's February 3, 2010 Early Response Action (ERA) Work Plan. Set forth below are APS' comments on the RID Work Plan.

In addition to these comments, APS agrees with and joins in the comments both Honeywell and Salt River Project have each submitted to ADEQ on the Rid Work Plan.

APS Comments

1. As a condition of the RID ERA approval, ADEQ required RID to complete a *risk analysis work plan documenting the risks and demonstrating how and when the ERA will mitigate the risks* related to the RID claim of a current risk to the public health from exposure to VOCs in the West Van Buren Area (WVBA). As stated in the ADEQ June 24, 2010 letter, "The RID [ERA] work plan states there is a current risk to the public health from exposure to VOCs (from both air and water) within the West Van Buren Area (WVBA), however, specific documentation about the

risks and how the risks will be mitigated during the ERA implementation has not yet been provided.”

The RID Work Plan is unresponsive, insufficient and does not meet requirements of WQARF rules. A.A.C. R18-16-401 provides the definition of the components of the risk assessment as *“Site-specific human health risk assessment means a scientific evaluation of the probability of an adverse effect to human health from exposure to specific types and concentrations of contaminants at or from a Site. A site-specific human health risk assessment contains four components: identification of potential contaminants; an exposure assessment; a toxicity assessment; and a risk characterization.”* While the RID submittal contains what is characterized as a Public Health Exposure Assessment and Mitigation Work Plan, it is not sufficient to complete a risk analysis.

2. Overall protection of human health is one of the basic goals of both WQARF and the federal Superfund program. Clearly an adequate risk assessment is key to meeting that goal. Riddled throughout the National Contingency Plan (40 C.F.R. Part 300) are requirements linked to an adequate risk assessment. For example, 40 C.F.R. §300.430(a)(ii)(B) addresses use of operable units whenever early actions are "appropriate to achieve significant risk reduction". 40 C.F.R. §300.430(a)(iii) provides the United State Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) directive on remedial alternatives that "address the principal threats posed by a site". Remedy selection also uses the risk assessment data: one of the nine remedy selection criteria is to determine whether a particular remedy can adequately protect human health and the environment, in both the short- and long-term, from unacceptable risks posed by hazardous substances, pollutants, or contaminants present at the site. 40 C.F.R. §300.430 (e) (9)(iii). Unfortunately, the RID Work plan is grossly inadequate to support the remedial decision making before ADEQ.
3. The RID Work Plan does not follow standard risk assessment protocol established by EPA and adopted by ADEQ as provided in the following references:
 - EPA 1989, Risk Assessment Guidance for Superfund: Volume I Human Health Evaluation Manual (Part A) EPA/540/1-89/002, December 1989.
 - EPA 1998, Risk Assessment Guidance for Superfund: Volume I Human Health Evaluation Manual (Part D, Standardized Planning, Reporting, and Review of Superfund Risk Assessments) January, Publication 9285.7-01D

The RID Work Plan does not meet the requirements of the ADEQ conditional approval letter and should not be approved by ADEQ. A site-specific risk assessment is required

to conduct a risk analysis. APS appreciates the opportunity to provide these comments to ADEQ. If you have any questions regarding these comments, please contact Judy Heywood at 602-250-3850.

Sincerely,



Scott Davis
Director, Environmental Policy and Programs
Arizona Public Service Company

cc: Benjamin H. Grumbles, ADEQ Director (via email - bhg@azdeq.gov)
Henry R. Darwin, ADEQ Assistant Director (via email - hrd@azdeq.gov)
Amanda Stone, ADEQ Director, Office of Waste Programs (via email - as3@azdeq.gov)
Julie J. Riemenschneider, ADEQ Remedial Projects Section, Manager (via email - jjr@azdeq.gov)
Judy Heywood, APS Remedial Project Manager (via email - Judith.heywood@aps.com)
Ken Miller, APS Law Department (via email - kennth.miller@aps.com)
Molly Cagle, Vinson & Elkins (via email - mcagle@velaw.com)