

Arizona Department of Environmental Quality CPP Outreach Plan and Report

04 Jan 2016

Introduction

As required by 40 CFR 60.5765(a)(3), this report provides a demonstration of:

- Opportunity for public comment on the initial submittal;
- Meaningful engagement with stakeholders, including vulnerable communities, during the initial submittal preparation period; and
- Plans for engagement during development of the final plan.

This report is generated from an Access database that ADEQ uses to plan and track CPP outreach activities. The report identifies:

- The types of outreach in which ADEQ has engaged or plans to engage during the initial submittal preparation period (Table 1);
- Communities, including vulnerable communities, that ADEQ will attempt to engage in the public discussion of Arizona's § 111(d) plan (Table 2)
- The types of impacts that may be expected from implementation of the Clean Power Plan (CPP), according to the Notice of Final Rulemaking (Table 3);
- Arizona organizations that represent the interests of or have existing relationships with vulnerable communities and that may assist or partner with ADEQ in its outreach efforts (Table 4);
- Planned or completed outreach events (Table 5).

During the development of the initial submittal, monthly drafts of this report will be generated and made available on ADEQ's CPP Stakeholder Process Website:

<http://www.azdeq.gov/enviro/air/stakeholder.html>

Table 1: Outreach Types

<u>Outreach Type</u>	<u>Description</u>
Stakeholder	Stakeholder meetings held monthly at ADEQ's offices in Phoenix; open to public including members and representatives of vulnerable communities; conference call access is available
Local Meeting	In-person meeting with specific communities at a location convenient for the community members
Conference Call	Conference call with a specific community or its representatives
Participation	Participation in an outreach event sponsored by another organization
Mass Mailing	Mass mailings to community members with a questionnaire that can be mailed in or completed online
TBD	To be determined

Table 2: Communities

<u>Name</u>	<u>Description</u>
Indian Tribes	Tribal lands located within the boundaries of the State of Arizona
Rural	Residents of rural areas served by electric cooperatives
Employees	Employees of coal-fired power plants
NGCC	Residents of areas in the vicinity of NGCC EGUs
Low Income	Low income residents of Arizona
POC	People of color living anywhere in Arizona
Public	All members of the public, including vulnerable communities

Table 3: Impacts

<u>Name</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Type</u>
Climate Change Mitigation	Mitigation of future climate change resulting from the implementation of the CPP as part of the United States' contribution to the Paris Agreement	Benefit
Conventional Pollutant Mitigation	Reduction in emissions of conventional pollutants (e.g. NOx, SO2) resulting from implementation of the CPP	Benefit
Employment Opportunities	Potential new jobs that may result from the CPP's encouragement of clean energy technologies	Benefit
NGCC Increases	Increases in NGCC generation, and resulting increases in local emissions of conventional pollutants, resulting from the CPP's incentive to shift from fossil-fuel steam to NGCC	Detriment
Employment Losses	Potential losses in employment resulting from the CPP's incentives to retire or curtail high-carbon generation	Detriment
Rate Increases	Potenital increases in electricity rates resulting from the costs of compliance with the CPP	Detriment

Table 4: Organizations

Arizona Community Action Association (ACAA)

Type: NGO

Communities: Low Income

Region(s): Navajo Nation, Arizona

Description:

Website: <http://azcaa.org/>

Representative(s):

Kevin Hengehold, Energy Program Director

Email:

khengehold@azcaa.org

Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)

Type: Government

Communities: Indian Tribes

Region(s): Arizona

Description: The federal government government has a trust responsibility to American Indians.

Website: <http://www3.epa.gov/>

Representative(s):

Anita Lee

Email:

Forgotten People Community Development Corporation (FPCD)

Type: NGO

Communities: Indian Tribes

Region(s): Arizona

Description:

Website: <http://www.forgottennavajopeople.com/>

Representative(s):

Don Yellowman

JoAnn Armenta

Email:

Grand Canyon State Electric Cooperative Association (GCSECA)

Type: Business

Communities: Rural

Region(s): Arizona

Description:

Website: <http://www.gcseca.coop/>

Representative(s):

Philip Bashaw, Director of Government Relations and
Grassroots Advocacy

Email:

pbashaw@gcseca.coop

Inter Tribal Council of Arizona (ITCA)

Type: Government

Communities: Indian Tribes

Region(s): Arizona

Description:

Website: <http://itcaonline.com/>

Representative(s):

Shaina White

Email:

shaina.white@itcaonline.com

Table 5: Outreach Events

Completed

September Meeting

Type:	Stakeholder	Participating Organizations:	GCSECA, ACAA, ADEQ
Communities:	Public	Location:	ADEQ Office, Phoenix, AZ
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation	Date:	09/01/2015 9:30 AM
Region:	Arizona		

Notes:

The meeting covered accomplishments of the previous two phases of stakeholder meetings, regulatory developments and a presentation on the final CPP rule published in August.

October Meeting

Type:	Stakeholder	Participating Organizations:	GCSECA, ACAA, ADEQ
Communities:	Public	Location:	ADEQ Office, Phoenix, AZ
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation	Date:	10/06/2015 9:30 AM
Region:	Arizona		

Notes:

The meeting covered regulatory developments, the structure of ADEQ's stakeholder process, and a presentation on the proposed federal plan.

November Meeting

Type:	Stakeholder	Participating Organizations:	GCSECA, ACAA, ADEQ
Communities:	Public	Location:	ADEQ Office, Phoenix, AZ
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation	Date:	11/03/2015 9:30 AM
Region:	Arizona		

Notes:

The meeting included a discussion of comments on the proposed federal plan, a presentation on the CPP requirements for outreach to vulnerable communities, and a summary of ADEQ's work plan for completing an initial submittal by 9/6/2016.

CPP Training for Tribal Communities

Type:	Participation	Participating Organizations:	EPA, FPCD, Dine CARE, ADEQ
Communities:	Indian Tribes, Low Income	Location:	Moenkopi Legacy Inn & Suites, Tuba City, AZ
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation, Conventional Pollutant Mitigation, Employment Opportunities	Date:	12/10/2015 8:00 AM
Region:	Northeastern Tribal Lands		

Notes:

ADEQ staff participated in the "Governmental Resources Panel" and provided a 20-minute presentation on Arizona's process for developing a 111(d) plan and how the plan could affect tribal communities. Staff also spoke with a number of tribal community representatives regarding their concerns about the state's plan.

Scheduled

January Meeting

Type:	Stakeholder	Participating Organizations:	ADEQ
Communities:	Public	Location:	ADEQ Office, Phoenix, AZ
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation	Date:	01/05/2016 9:30 AM
Region:	Arizona		
Notes:			

February Meeting

Type:	Stakeholder	Participating Organizations:	ADEQ
Communities:	Public	Location:	ADEQ Office, Phoenix, AZ
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation	Date:	02/10/2016 9:30 AM
Region:	Arizona		
Notes:			

March Meeting

Type:	Stakeholder	Participating Organizations:	ADEQ
Communities:	Public	Location:	ADEQ Office, Phoenix, AZ
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation	Date:	03/01/2016 9:30 AM
Region:	Arizona		
Notes:			

April Meeting

Type:	Stakeholder	Participating Organizations:	ADEQ
Communities:	Public	Location:	ADEQ Office, Phoenix, AZ
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation	Date:	04/05/2016 9:30 AM
Region:	Arizona		
Notes:			

May Meeting

Type:	Stakeholder	Participating Organizations:	ADEQ
Communities:	Public	Location:	ADEQ Office, Phoenix, AZ
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation	Date:	05/10/2016 9:30 AM
Region:	Arizona		
Notes:			

June Meeting

Type:	Stakeholder	Participating Organizations:	ADEQ
Communities:	Public	Location:	ADEQ Office, Phoenix, AZ
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation	Date:	06/14/2016 9:30 AM
Region:	Arizona		
Notes:			

July Meeting

Type:	Stakeholder	Participating Organizations:	ADEQ
Communities:	Public	Location:	ADEQ Office, Phoenix, AZ
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation	Date:	07/12/2016 9:30 AM
Region:	Arizona		
Notes:			

August Meeting

Type:	Stakeholder	Participating Organizations:	ADEQ
Communities:	Public	Location:	ADEQ Office, Phoenix, AZ
Impacts to be Addressed:		Date:	08/02/2016 9:30 AM
Region:	Arizona		
Notes:			

Unscheduled

Benson Meeting

Type:	Local Meeting	Participating Organizations:	GCSECA, ADEQ, AZLEG
Communities:	Rural, Employees, Low Income	Location:	
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation, Conventional Pollutant Mitigation, Employment Losses	Date:	
Region:	Southeastern Arizona		
Notes:			

A meeting near Benson to address the potential impact of the CPP on the nearby Apache Generating Station may be appropriate. This meeting could be coordinated with a possible tour of the Apache facility by Arizona legislators.

Outreach to Maricopa County Communities Near NGCC

Type:	TBD	Participating Organizations:	ADEQ
Communities:	NGCC, Low Income, POC	Location:	TBD
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation, Conventional Pollutant Mitigation, NGCC Increases	Date:	
Region:	West Maricopa County		

Notes:

According to EPA's EJ Screening Report for the CPP, NGCC plants in Western Maricopa County are generally located near communities with relatively high minority and low-income populations. Since the CPP may result in shifts in generation to these plants, some form of outreach specifically targeting these areas would be appropriate.

Meeting with Navajo and Hopi Tribal Communities

Type:	Local Meeting	Participating Organizations:	FPCD, Dine CARE, ADEQ
Communities:	Indian Tribes, Low Income	Location:	Tuba City (tentative)
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation, Conventional Pollutant Mitigation, Employment Opportunities	Date:	
Region:	Northeastern Tribal Lands		

Notes:

The purpose of this meeting will be to provide tribal communities with more detailed information on ADEQ's process for developing a 111(d) plan than could be provided at the December 10, 2015 EPA training and to receive input from tribal community members.

Outreach to Communities Near Coal-Fired Plants

Type:	TBD	Participating Organizations:	
Communities:	Employees	Location:	TBD
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation, Conventional Pollutant Mitigation, Employment Losses	Date:	
Region:	Northeastern Arizona		
Notes:			

State-Wide Outreach

Type:	Mass Mailing	Participating Organizations:	ADEQ
Communities:	Low Income, POC	Location:	N/A
Impacts to be Addressed:	Climate Change Mitigation, Conventional Pollutant Mitigation, Employment Opportunities, Rate Increases	Date:	
Region:	Arizona		
Notes:			