

ADVISORY PANEL ON EMERGING CONTAMINANTS (APEC)

February 15, 2013, 10:00 a.m.

Arizona Department of Health Services; State Laboratory
250 N. 17th Ave., Phoenix, Arizona 85007

Panel Members:					
Morteza Abbaszadegan	x	Pejman Eshragih	x	Christopher Jensen	
Leif Abrell	x	Steve Figgins	x	John Kmiec	x
Steve Baker	x	Michael Fink		Laura McCasland	x
Jennifer Botsford	x	Robert Fromm		Jamie McCullough	x
Cindy Garcia		Cindy Garcia	x	Sara Presler	
Kelly Bright	x	Chuck Gerba		Jeff Prevatt	x
Al Brown	x	Randy Gottler	x	Dennis Price	
Mark Brusseau	ph	Brad Hill		Cathy Propper	x
Alissa Coes	x	Chris Hill		Dan Quintanar	x
Nick Paretti		Kiril Hristovski		Channah Rock	
Patrick Cunningham		Anupa Jain	x	Shane Snyder	x
Ron Eisele II		Myra Jefferson		Joli Weiss	x
				Doyle Wilson	x

Panel Staff					
Henry Darwin		John Calkins	x	Molly Mullins	x
Mike Fulton	x	Mason Bolitho	x	Deborah Huie	x
Chuck Graf	x	Julie Hoskin	x		

Agenda:

1. Welcome and Introductions
2. Approval of Minutes from previous meeting
3. Finalize Mission Statement
4. Presentation
 - a. Risk Assessment 101 – Jennifer Botsford
5. Formation of Committees
 - a. Microbial EC's
 - b. Chemical EC's
 - c. Outreach/Education
6. Break
7. Expected Committee Outcomes and Next Steps: Discussion
8. Website Demo
9. Call to Public
10. Next Meeting
11. Adjourn

APEC – MEETING MINUTES

Friday, February 15, 2013 - Meeting # 02

1) Welcome and Introductions

- a. Mike Fulton
 - i) Welcomed everyone to second meeting of the Panel and gave special thanks to the Arizona Department of Health Services for hosting meeting.
 - ii) Introductions: Panel members and guests introduced themselves.
 - iii) The meeting agenda for Fri, Feb 15, 2013 was shown on screen and reviewed.
- b. Randy Gottler
 - i) Mr. Gottler was introduced as the new co-chair for APEC by Chair Fulton.

2) Approval of Meeting Minutes from previous meeting

- a. Meeting Minutes sent out to Panel for review on Jan 4.
 - i) Meeting minutes were presented and approved.

3) Finalize Mission Statement

- a. Draft of revised mission statement shown on screen. The mission statement reflected edits made by Chuck Graf based on Panel comments from the first meeting.
 - i) Further comments on Mission Statement 1: *Provide guidance on identifying and managing unregulated chemical and microbial contaminants in Arizona's waters so as to minimize risk to human health and the environment.*
 - (1) Suggestion to substitute the word "constituents" instead of "contaminants."
 - (2) Suggestion to replace verbiage of "unregulated chemical and microbial contaminants" with "chemical and microbial contaminants of concern". Point was made that there are regulated contaminants that are also of concern.
 - (a) Explanation followed that the terminology "unregulated" was specifically chosen because "contaminants of concern" was vague and hard to define. Discussion followed with the consensus that the term "unregulated" set a clear boundary/parameter that the Panel could work with.
 - (b) Chair Fulton commented that he thought it was important to use the term "unregulated" in the context of the Panel's work as the vision for the panel was to address unregulated chemicals.
 - ii) It was also recognized that the further deliberations of the Panel and the written documents it produces can elaborate on what should be addressed.
- b. In the end, there was general consensus that the revised mission statement as presented is an appropriate place to start. For the record, this mission statement is reproduced below:

The mission of the Advisory Panel on Emerging Contaminants shall be to:

- 1. Provide guidance on identifying and managing unregulated chemical and microbial contaminants in Arizona's water so as to minimize risk to human health and the environment;*
- 2. Identify research opportunities and funding mechanisms to improve our understanding of emerging contaminant issues;*
- 3. Provide guidance on effectively communicating issues of unregulated chemical and microbial contaminants to the citizens of Arizona;*
- 4. Seek to become an influential voice for addressing unregulated chemical and microbial contaminants on a statewide basis and contributing to the national discussion.*

4) Presentation; (*Presentation will be available on website for review*)

- a. Risk Assessment 101 – Jennifer Botsford, Manager, Environmental Toxicology Program, ADHS.
 - i) Handout on terminology distributed; PowerPoint presentation will be made available on website.

APEC – MEETING MINUTES

Friday, February 15, 2013 - Meeting # 02

- (1) Question asked about whether epidemiology has been worked out with single compounds? Have compounding/mixture effects been considered in establishing the MCLs?
 - (a) Answer is that we are starting to see some mixtures now being addressed by EPA.
- (2) How does EPA define acceptable risk?
 - (a) Answer is that the EPA has document describing acceptable risk in more detail.
- (3) Question asked if the Panel wants to discuss risk and explicitly add that idea to the mission statement?
 - (a) Response was that this issue appears to fall under Mission Statement 3 and could be discussed in that context: *Provide guidance on effectively communicating issues of unregulated chemical and microbial contaminants to the citizens of Arizona.*
- (4) Question asked has the State of Arizona adopted any MCLs that are more conservative than the Federal EPA MCLs?
 - (a) Answer is No.

5) Break

6) Formation of Committees;

- a. Chair Fulton described the basic boundaries/guidelines for the committees knowing that in the future they will eventually take on a life of their own. Three committees were proposed: Microbial Emerging Contaminants, Chemical Emerging Contaminants, and Outreach and Education.
 - i) Slides were shown on screen explaining the intent, framework, starting point for each committee.
 - (1) **Question asked about ADEQ's role in APEC.**
 - (a) APEC is being sponsored by ADEQ. However, as ADEQ has stated before, the Panel is not about developing regulations. One of its purposes is to consider and develop guidance that will go out to bigger audience including public and private utilities, university researchers, and the public. ADEQ convened this Panel partly in response to a recommendation of Governor Brewer's Blue Ribbon Panel for Water Sustainability..The Blue Ribbon Panel was driven by the State and co-chaired by three agencies--ADEQ, the Arizona Department of Water Resources, and the Arizona Corporation Commission. ADEQ sees this as an opportunity fulfill one of the recommendations of the Blue Ribbon Panel and communicate to stakeholders in regards to emerging contaminants and water sustainability. As important, though, ADEQ has convened APEC in its own right due to the increasing importance of better understanding emerging contaminants in Arizona's waters for the purpose of maintaining safe supplies.
 - ii) It will be necessary and important to loop back within each of the committees and provide feedback to the full Panel for effective communication.
 - (1) Outreach and Education may be a big committee. It is also a very important committee as effective communication is not always a strong point for scientists. The Panel will want to convey accurate information to individuals and the public without unduly alarming them.
 - (2) Question: Will the Outreach and Education Committee be responsible for maintaining the APEC website?
Answer: The committee should discuss. It may be something they wish to take on. For the time being, ADEQ will maintain the website.
 - b. Committee chairs will facilitate the work of the committee including how best to organize them. Chair Fulton announced the names of the Panel members who volunteered to chair the committees, as well as the ADEQ staff who will act as liaisons to the committees:
 - i) Chemical ECs – John Kmiec
 - (1) liaison – Julie Hoskin
 - ii) Microbial ECs – Jeff Prevatt
 - (1) liaison – John Calkins
 - iii) Outreach and Education – Dan Quintanar
 - (1) liaison – Chuck Graf
 - iv) The information gathered by the committees will be distributed to the other committees and Panel as a whole via the ADEQ website. This will ensure that other panel members can stay plugged into what's developing on the other committees.

7) Expected Committee Outcomes and Next Steps; Discussion

APEC – MEETING MINUTES

Friday, February 15, 2013 - Meeting # 02

- a. A number of suggestions were made by panel members for the committees:
 - i) Website suggestions
 - (1) Each committee should have a separate link so that committee members and other panel members can keep abreast of developments in the committee.
 - (2) A questionnaire should be included on the website where the public can post questions/comments/suggestions for ADEQ and/or APEC.
 - (a) Put one or two individual's numbers/e-mail addresses on the website as being the contacts for communications and questions from the public.
 - (3) Make available links on the website for posts by Panel member which feature their own and their organization's areas of expertise.
 - (4) Post an FAQ page.
 - (5) Develop an RSS feed to alert panel members and others when new information is posted to the website.
 - (6) Provide historical background information on the website.
 - (7) Send additional comments/suggestions for the website to Deborah Huie.
 - ii) Suggestion was made to reach out to the AZ Water Association. They will be holding their next conference in May and it would be a good opportunity to make contact with them about APEC's work and to engage the smaller municipalities and other entities not represented on the Panel.
- 8) **Website Demo**
 - a. The APEC web pages are now up on the ADEQ website, and Mason Bolitho demonstrated them on the screen.
 - i) Go to: AZDEQ.gov / water topics / first tab
 - (1) <http://www.azdeq.gov/environ/water/apec/index.html>
- 9) **Call to Public;**
 - a. No questions or comments from public.
- 10) **Next Meeting;**
 - a. Will be determined after having a chance to meet with committee chairs and give their committees an opportunity to meet first. Anticipate that the next Panel meeting will be early-mid April.
 - b. Steve Baker offered to give tour of the ADHS lab after this meeting
- 11) **Adjourn;**
 - a. 11:50 a.m.

Meeting minutes compiled by Deborah Huie.